

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

**AMY VELEZ, PENNI ZELINKOFF, MINEL  
HIDER TOBERTGA, MICHELLE  
WILLIAMS, JENNIFER WAXMAN-RECHT,  
KAREN LIGGINS, LORI HORTON,  
HOLLY WATERS, WENDY PINSON,  
ROBERTA VONLINTEL, ASHLEY  
NARMOUR, CATHERINE WHITE, KELLY  
CORBETT, SUE EARL, JAMIE HOLLAND,  
JOAN DURKIN, SIMONA LOPES,  
MARYANNE JACOBY and MARTA  
DEYNE,**

**04 Civ. 09194 (CM)**

**Individually and on Behalf of Others  
Similarly Situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**v.**

**NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION,**

**Defendant.**

**DEFENDANT NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION'S  
NOTICE OF ITS MOTION FOR JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW**

**PLEASE TAKE NOTICE THAT,** upon its accompanying Memorandum in Support of its Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law and Appendix in Support of its Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law, Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation (“NPC”), by its attorneys, Vedder Price P.C., hereby moves this Court for an Order pursuant to Rule 50(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure granting judgment as a matter of law to NPC on Plaintiffs’ class pay and promotion to first-line manager discrimination claims, and class harassment and hostile work environment on the basis of pregnancy claims, on the grounds that Plaintiffs have failed to

satisfy their *prima facie* burden for these claims. Accordingly, NPC is entitled to judgment as a matter of law pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 50(a) on these claims.

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS  
CORPORATION

By: /s/ Richard H. Schnadig  
One of Its Attorneys

Richard H. Schnadig  
Thomas G. Abram  
Aaron R. Gelb  
Sara J. Kagay  
Elizabeth N. Hall  
Vedder Price P.C.  
222 North LaSalle Street, Suite 2600  
Chicago, Illinois 60601-1003  
312-609-7500  
312-609-5005 (facsimile)

Jonathan A. Wexler  
Vedder Price P.C.  
1633 Broadway  
47th Floor  
New York, New York 10019  
Telephone: (212) 407-7700  
Fax: (212) 407-7799

Amy L. Bess  
Vedder Price P.C.  
875 15th Street NW  
Suite 725  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
202.312.3320  
202.312.3322 (facsimile)

Dated: April 27, 2010

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned, an attorney, certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing DEFENDANT'S NOTICE OF MOTION FOR JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW was filed electronically and served on the following by depositing same in the United States mail, with proper first-class postage prepaid, before 5:00 p.m. on April 27, 2010:

David Sanford  
Katherine Kimpel  
Katherine Leong  
Felicia Medina  
Sharon Eubanks  
**SANFORD, WITTELS & HEISLER, LLP**  
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 310  
Washington, DC 20009

Steven Wittels  
Jeremy Heisler  
**SANFORD, WITTELS & HEISLER, LLP**  
1350 Avenue of the Americas, 31st Floor  
New York, NY 10022

Grant Morris  
**LAW OFFICES OF GRANT E. MORRIS, ESQ.**  
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 310  
Washington D.C. 20009

/s/ Richard H. Schnadig  
Richard H. Schnadig